



Musethica

SUMMARY REPORT OF MUSETHICA IMPACT EVALUATION

Dra. Patricia E. Almaguer-Kalixto

Dr. Oscar S. Álvarez-Macotela

08.11.2016

Sobre esta evaluación

The impact evaluation of the project Musethica was made by INTERHES * in March- November 2016 at the request of the Executive management of Musethica Spain.

***INTERHES Interdisciplinary Institute on Human Ecology and Sustainability** is an Institute that contributes to strengthening settlements and sustainable human communities through the interdisciplinary systemic research, helping to improve the social and environmental impact of projects of technological and social innovation. We work together with organizations, interest groups and local governments for community projects to be inclusive, resilient and sustainable through an approach of human ecology, emphasizing the interrelationships of systems socio-ecologicos. www.interhes.org

SUMMARY REPORT OF MUSETHICA IMPACT EVALUATION

This report uses systemic methodology to support the identification of the social impact generated by Musethica. The report shows empirical elements derived from indicators that were designed to analyze the social impact generated from its foundation in 2012 to November 2016.

After four years from its foundation, there is an interest to generate instruments to measure the impact that the program is making in the musicians and in the social centers where they play. This is an evaluative document that has two objectives:

- a) Design a methodology to register the effects and changes in musicians, audience and social spaces where they play, generating measurement instruments that allow to monitor the project
- b) Detect changes that occur to evaluate them and get feedback about the program

The objective of social impact measurement is to contribute to articulate the activities of the organization in a clear and transparent way, as well as to demonstrate the effects that they are having.

Measuring impact implies putting together evidence to evaluate if a social change is being achieved as a result of an activity or service. The evaluation process tries to actively engage people, organizations and institutions in the community to improve programs through the measurement of activities' results.

On the basis of Musethica's specific needs as an organization, we decided to combine the Methodology for Impact Analysis and Assessment (MIAA) with an instrument that was created by the same organization, an Outcomes Matrix. The MIAA includes a revision of the internal logic to understand the structure of the organization, its actions and processes. It is a support system for impact analysis in which the methodology can be adapted to the specific needs of the organization that is evaluated (depending on sector, mission, perspective...)

Musethica has addressed five of the nine objectives that it states in its different documents, with 13 indicators. From this assessment, we suggest some indicators that allow to analyze the nine objectives with 33 indicators. We don't have information of all of them, because they have been designed after the activities have taken place, but they will allow the organization -if it adopts them- to give a strategic perspective to its future assessments and improvement processes. In addition to these indicators, the assessment was complemented with the MIAA methodology.

The document is divided in three parts. The first one refers to the design of the assessment, explaining why the measurement of social impact is important; it also explains the methodologies that have been adopted and the innovations that have been suggested for the assessment. The second part refers to the results derived from the MIAA methodology that has been applied to the organizational dimension, and from the results based on objectives where the users' perspective is combined: musicians, social centers and audiences. The results are shown with robust empirical material that was collected by Musethica from 2013-15 and complemented with new tools from 2016. The last part deals with the conclusions, recommendations and appendices.

Conclusions of the report:

1- Musethica is a culturally sensitive program that contributes to the local community.

The Musethica program focuses on people: musicians and audience. The organization makes this clear through its public, its international perspective and the interactions it promotes. Musethica's coordinators put special emphasis on the previous process; they coordinate with key people at the social centers and with the musicians that will play in the concert, to anticipate possible contexts and guide the expectations towards a high-level musical experience. The rest, the concert, depends on how musicians play, their ability to share their musical ideas and the ability of the audience.

2- In four years Musethica has become an association that has a solid organization and promotes activities that are coherent with its mission

The structure of the organization is solid; it has consolidated three functions: artistic, social and project management. There is also a board made of the members of the association, which is expected to include representatives from each of the key agents involved. The local associations that have been set up over these past years are specified in its website and documents.

Results based on MIAA methodology indicators are presented in the section dedicated to mission compliance, where the report contrasts the coherence among the mission, the understanding of the problem, the type of beneficiaries, general and specific objectives, and the quality of the data. In this section observations and suggestions are specified for each heading, to make sure that they are directly related to the heading that is evaluated. There are quantitative indicators and from this evaluation, mixed indicators (quantitative and qualitative) that support the impact that this project has achieved. In conclusion, the organization has reached its goals and objectives, adapting to emergent processes in an effective way.

3- There is evidence for a new teaching methodology which is consolidating

Results per objectives that have considered the perspective of the user and/or beneficiary are the basis to state that Musethica is systematically progressing in the development of a new teaching methodology. There are objective criteria that emphasize the quality and musical excellence, such as the selection process for musical mentors and young musicians, the quality of their execution from the point of view of the mentors, and the selection of complex repertoires. The repertoires are a stimulating challenge for young musicians and an achievable task for the short time they represent Musethica's activities. The achievement of the objectives is satisfactory for the majority of the participants.

The teaching methodology is consolidating, because it is receiving feedback from the people who have taken part so far. It's important to state that the factors that are considered innovative are positively valued by the participants, both mentors and students: the concert as an educational process; the interaction between mentors and students in the creation of new groups and quartets, the interaction of musicians with non-conventional audiences. But to consolidate the teaching methodology the systemic perspective may need to be reinforced. For example by formalizing protocols that can be supported by pedagogical research that can take a closer look at the performance reached with this methodology, which is an opportunity for the program. Another suggestion is to disseminate the characteristics of the educational program.

4-. There is a perception of improvement in the musical skills and capabilities of young participants

From a boost in confidence in the stage or, as a student that took part put it: a de-dramatization of stress, the majority of the participants that were interviewed reported a better understanding of the concert (reflecting on the musical habits such as preparation, listening and concentration), as well as the possibility to improve its musical expression and improve the musical teamwork. The result can't be generalized without a way to measure that takes into account the differences per instrument, the type of activity... but at this stage, the objectives of the indicators was to generate testimonies about the process that could later be a starting point for future measurement processes. It is crucial to show the importance of having an individual baseline to be able to distinguish to what extent those changes can be attributed to the program or not. That baseline could be generated by systematically implementing a short self-appraisal survey.

5-. The program improves the transnational mobility of young musicians and at the same time strengthens the local social network with a global dialogue

The benefits of the young musicians' international mobility are not only for them, but also contributes to the cultural and social consciousness strengthening local bonds in the social centers. On the one hand this increases the knowledge about cultural and social diversity through the specific interaction that takes place in Musethica's activities, both with the team and with the local centers that take part. Students appreciate that the program allows them to connect with important international musicians, but also diverse audiences and realities. This experience allows them to experiment different social contexts and, above all, reinforce their communication through music. On the other hand, when musicians directly interact with the social centers' beneficiaries, they experiment a positive influence in the form of an increase in social self-esteem around potentially marginalized or excluded groups. We see how the Musethica idea of generating new non-conventional audiences materializes with the musical appreciation and dialogue with excellent musicians that go to their spaces to share their abilities and musical message.

6-. The participation in Musethica's activities is a significant experience for the young participants

In participants' testimonies, both students and mentors, Musethica's activities represent a significant experience because of the interaction as a musician with other realities, the possibility to reflect on their role as musicians in society. But with objective data we cannot infer from that a significant change in the way of being a musician. The majority of the testimonies are highly emotional, but we need a longitudinal monitoring to be able to infer that the following actions were a result of Musethica's impact. In this sense, objective 5 has already a significant number of musical groups that have been constituted thanks to participation in Musethica.

7-. Musethica is achieving the diffusion of classical among people in risk of exclusion and consolidating new audiences

There is evidence that Musethica has impacted society through the diffusion of the experience of live classical music concerts in places selected with this purpose. On the one

hand, we can see the results of the quantitative indicators with which the program has been monitored; those results show important progress in the collaboration with social centers. On the other hand, we have the testimonies of the perceptions of the public in these contexts. Many times the audiences are groups in risk of exclusion because of poverty, social class prejudices, discrimination or distance because of nationality, ethnic origins or physical access, but the experience of a live classical music concert was a very gratifying experience in all those environments. These are the effects of the direct stimulus of music, which can't be attributed to a substantial change in those groups¹ conduct because the concert is an isolated situation. Their feedback gives information to understand that the effect of the concerts is positive in general, there is a direct reaction to the musical stimulus, the majority of attendees become classical music audiences who listen to the musicians carefully, and they would like to have more activities of this type so they decide to continue collaborating with Musethica and/or implement similar activities in their center. In relation to objective 7, which is creating and consolidating new audiences, the numbers identify an increase in the number of concerts and in the number of attendees to concerts that take place in traditional places for classical music. The real potential in creating new audiences is found in relation to the social centers.

8-. There are emerging synergies among classical music, education, and social services

Musethica's activities have begun to generate regular mechanisms of cooperation with some special education centers, social services centers and other institutions. They are emerging but after four years have begun to consolidate, users' assessment is positive and have an explicit interest in maintain and amplify these activities. The employees and contacts in those organizations are active promoters of Musethica's concerts. These people can detect in a greater degree the immediate effect and long-term effect of the interaction with Musethica. Maintaining these activities could encourage more detailed empirical explorations of the Musethica's effects in specific communities.

9-. The diffusion of the Musethica model is the biggest opportunity for the organization

There is a diffusion process of the educational model that could be made clear by indicators defined by the organization. These indicators of the degree of success of the promotion of Musethica's educational model, with the aim of communicating it to professional music teachers, members of Conservatories and the public, could be complemented with other actions carried out by Musethica, like the places where Musethica is present, the perception about its educational model from the point of view of professionals (music teachers, other musical professionals) and presence in the media. More research is needed to understand the long-term effects of classical music in specific audiences like the ones that Musethica is interested in.

All of the participant mentors that were interviewed, who are important musicians, acknowledge the contributions of the program and their innovative elements. We think there is an opportunity if the educational program progresses to a consolidation stage though its formalization and diffusion. Keeping an active alumni network could be crucial, as well as continuing with the diffusion of the objectives, values and proposals in an strategic way through the different media, social networks, and specialized forums.

¹ More research is needed to understand the long-term effects of classical music in the specific audiences Musethica aims at.

10-. There is evidence of social impact, but more systematic research is needed

The report presents evidence of the impact both in musicians as direct beneficiaries and in the organizations that take part. But more evidence is needed to detect trends in the different aspects of the social impact generated by Musethica. The evidence presented here reinforces the perception that Musethica is generating positive social impact in different geographical areas and human dimensions. It is important to be careful when interpreting the attribution of direct causality, especially because of the limitations of this study and because other types of instruments and longitudinal methodology is needed to reach in a more precise way the degree of impact on the transformation of human aspects in a way that could be attributed to Musethica.

11-. Apart from the individual and group impact there is also an impact in the musical sector, that is being valued, strengthen and reinforced

This point is another opportunity; if students that take part in Musethica's activities are followed-up, if subsequent meetings are organized, and contact among alumni is maintained by exploring the social capital that is activated through the participation in the program, the level of relationships and trust, as well as its for future synergies between musicians. A key aspect of the participation of young musicians in Musethica's activities is that they contribute to assure the sustainability and impact of the project in the long-term. These experiences make young musicians become the best ambassadors for the Musethica model. Their social experiences and their improvement in their musical skills after taking part in Musethica's activities encourage these young musicians to contribute to the expansion of the project. The local musical community benefits from the specialists with whom it is possible to converse, open master-classes, young musicians with whom to generate new synergies; it could imply an energizing process of the sector if elements that reinforce this collateral impact are included in future activities.

12-. Musethica is interested in continuous improvement which is made clear from its interest in the process of evaluation

This report could not be written without quality data collected throughout these years when the project has taken part. Although the documentation process could be improved by increasing systematization, it stands out by being broad, organized and with a clear orientation to improve the process. The evaluation that is showed here is built upon these data and new data that are generated on the base of a collective analysis (between members of the organization and evaluators) with the aim of defining new indicators, not only quantitative ones but also mixed ones that allow to capture evidence of social impact from the perspective of beneficiaries. This evaluation also has its limitations and opportunities; from the results, new instruments can be designed to go deeper into the direction that the organization decides. Suggestions are formulated in section 7 of the results.